[श्री नारायण दत्त तिवारी]

बनाए रखें और अपनी यादों के उजाले बनाए रखें।

"उजाले अपनी यादों के हमारे साथ रहने दो,
न जाने किस गली में जिन्दगी की शाम हो जाए"

PERSONAL EXPLANATION

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENTS OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS AND WOMEN AND CHILD DEVELOPMENT IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA): Sir, I am grateful to you for giving me this opportunity clarify a statement I had made in the House on 23rd March, 1988 during Question Hour. I had by mistake said that Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, as Foreign Minister, had met the Prime Minister of Israel. Shri Vajpayee has in a personal explanation before the House on 24th March, 1988, denied the fact with the following words and I quote from his version:

"महोदय, यह तथ्य से परे है। जब मैं विदेश मंत्री था तो इजराइल के प्रधान मंत्री से नहीं मिला। श्रीमती आल्वा को ऐसी बात कहने के पहले अपने तथ्यों के बारे में जांच कर लेनी चाहिए थी।"

Sir, I wish to apologise to Shri Vajpayee and to the House for the mistake I inadvertently made in the course of my reply.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): That is sportsmanship.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: To put the record straight, Sir, I wish to quote from the record of the Rajya Sabha dated 13th June, 1980. Shri P. V. Narasimha Rao, the then hon. Minister had in an answer to a question informed the House and I quote from the record of the Rajya Sabha:

"Sir, according to Government's information Moshe Dayan visited India in August 1977 evidently at the instance of Shri Morarji Desai and Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee. He landed in Bombay and was flown to New Delhi in an IAF aircraft. Shri Desai and Shri Vajpayee met Moshe Dayan at No. 1, Akbar Road on the evening of August 15, 1.00 P.M. 1977. Moshe Dayan left for Bombay again in an IAF aircraft at 12.45 on August. 16, 1977."

I quote again; I am continuing the quotation:

"We have confirmation about one visit. About the other visits, I have to inform the House that they may have been..."—I am sorry—"about the possibility of these further visits because they had to be inferred in that manner from the statements made by the leaders of the Janata and the Bhartiya Janata Parties. We have no definite information about these subsequent visits. Evidently, after the first visit, the Pattern seems to have been changed."

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Madhya Pradesh): The apology has become meaningless.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let her complete the statement.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है सभापति महोदय। ... (**व्यवधान**) ... स्पष्टीकरण में विवाद की बातें नहीं उठाई जा सकती। ... (**व्यवधान**) ...

श्री कल्पनाथ राय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आदरणीय सभापति महोदय, आप पहले

बोलने दीजिए मंत्री महोदया को।... (**व्यवधान**)...आप मार्ग्रेट आल्वा जी को पूरी बात कहने दीजिए।...(**व्यवधान**)..इन्हें अपनी बात पूरी करने दीजिए।

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): Let her complete her statement

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: She has apologised, that is enough.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I raise objection to her statement. Where is the question of her statement? (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Sir, I want your permission to place it on record. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: She has not completed her statement.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, let me explain my objection.

श्री कल्पनाथ राय : आदरणीय सभापति महोदय, इनको पूरा करने दीजिए।.. (**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: She wants to clarify...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh): On a point of order.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: My point is.....

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Sir, I am not yielding.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : सभापति महोदय, सेल्फ-एक्सप्लेनेशन में ऐसे मामले नहीं उठा सकती, जिन पर विवाद है... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir. I am on a point of order. You cannot allow her to complete her statement.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Let me complete. I have just one more sentence.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: My point is that she is not relevant. I am on a point of order.

SHRI KALPNATH RAI: Let Mrs. Alva complete her speech.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Please hear my point of order. Let me tell you what is my point of order.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Let me complete my speech.

SHRI KALPNATH RAI: Let Mrs. Alva complete her speech.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Her statement is not complete.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न उसी पर उठाया जा रहा है, यह स्पष्टीकरण नहीं दे रहीं।... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, I am on a point of order. You have got to hear my point of order.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Let me complete my speech.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: It is not a speech.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: I am just finishing.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : आप उन्हें भाषण करने का मौका नहीं दे सकते।

श्री सभापति : अरे भाई, मैं कह रहा हूं न उनको ....(**व्यवधान**)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I object to it. I will not sit. You have got to hear my point of order.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : माइक, पाइंट आफ आर्डर तो सुनिये।

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I draw your attention to rule 241.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: If it is unparliamentary, you expunge it.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: She is only quoting from the debate. What is wrong in that?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: She cannot bring debatable issues while giving a personal explanation. Hear my point of order.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: I am making personal explanation. It has been cleared by the Chairman.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will hear all the points of order. She should be brief. I have asked her to conclude. If there is anything you want to say, I will hear.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: No.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: No. The point of order has to be allowed first.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: She has brought debatable issues. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you kindly hear me? I am only telling that....

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: You allowed her a personal explanation.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me complete. You are not permitting even me.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: If I have said anything unparliamentary, you expunge.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन का मौका दिया है । इस पर और बातें नहीं हो सकतीं ।

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: She is only quoting from the record.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: No debatable matter should be brought in this. That is the rule.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am on my legs please. One thing, I would like to say in the beginning. She should not be very long. She should conclude soon. Just a minute. Before we can say what is relevant and what is not, let the particular thing be complete. (*Interruptions*) Please. We all know, sometimes a thing is said, but the conclusion changes the whole thing, the whole context. Let her conclude.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: You should hear my point of order before you allow her.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have always the power, my powers are always there. Now you conclude quickly.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: One sentence. These answers speak for themselves.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): When an hon. Member is on a point of order, the point of order should be allowed first.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : आप पाइंट आफ आर्डर सुनिये फिर चाहे उसे रद्द कर दीजिये ।

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: The ruling has been given by the Chair.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: According to rules, when a Member is on a point of order, the point of order has to be heard and disposed of.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: On a personal explanation how can there be a point of order? There can be no point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There can be a point of order, but.....

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): How can there be a point of order?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hear me fully. That is the trouble.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Without hearing me.....

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: In a personal explanation you cannot bring any debatable issues.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: (*Interruptions*) These answers speak for themselves. I, therefore, correct ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, I have raised a point of order. (*Interruption*).

THE MINISTER OF PLANNING AND THE MINISTER OF PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): On point of order, a ruling has been given. First she should complete it. That is what he has ruled. It must be obeyed. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Sir, these answers speak for themse ves. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: On your point of order I would like to say that point of order can arise and should be heard. There is no doubt about that. You try to follow what I was telling. I have said point of order can be there, but what I was telling was that after the conclusion of her personal explanation, if you raise it, it would be much better. (*Interruptions*). But, since you are insisting, you raise the point of order. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: How can you change the ruling? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He has allowed me now to raise the point of order. Let me raise my point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: But the Chair had already given the ruling. How can be reverse his ruling? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, I draw your attention to Rule 241. It reads like this. I quote:

> "A member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the Council, but in this case no debatable matter may be brought forward, and no debate shall arise."

My point of order is that you have allowed Mrs. Margaret Alva... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Where is the debate? (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: This is on the record of the Rajya Sabha. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: You allowed Smt. Margaret Alva to clarify a statement. While clarifying the statement, he has brought in other matters which are not relevant at all. (*Interruptions*). She can only say what she had said on that day was wrong. (*Interruptions*) She has brought in Moshe Dayan, Morarji Desai and various other leaders of the Janata Government. It is all irrelevant. I have no objection if you want to have a debate on that, but on this she can only say that her statement was wrong She can apologise to the House. Nothing more than that. She has introduced extraneous things in this. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: I will do exactly what he wants. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, as I said, she will conclude soon. I will see her whole speech and if it comes within the mischief of these words used. But what you have read, I may read the whole thing: "A Member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the Council, but in this case no debatable matter may be brought for-

[Mr. Chairman]
ward and no debate shall arise." So, now you leave it to me, I will see if any debatable matter... (*Interruptions*)...I have the right to expunge and I have been telling all of you. So, you kindly conclude now.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: I am concluding, Sir. Sir, I only want to say that I have not made a speech. I have only quoted from the record of the Rajya Sabha word for word... (*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Sir, I am concluding. "These answers speak for themselves. I would, therefore, correct myself and say that Shri Vajpayee had met Moshe Dayan the Foreign Minister of Israel and not the Prime Minister as I stated. That is all."

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: She said the other day that he met the Prime Minister... (*Interruptions*). She has brought in irrelevant matter.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: I corrected myself.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What is your ruling on that?

MR. CHAIRMAN: My ruling is that I will go into the records. If she has brought any matter... (*Interruptions*)... if you are not satisfied, I cannot help it.

Now, I will go into the question. But in this case no debatable matter may be brought forward. Whatever comes within the terms of "debatable matter" I will definitely expunge.

Now, we will take up Special Mentions. Shri Bir Bhadra Pratap Singh.

SPECIAL MENTIONS

Leak of basic Amenities in the flats Built in Trans-Yamuna Areas

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, I have a submission to make on another matter.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we will take up Special Mentions.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Before that I want to make, Sir, yesterday...

MR. CHAIRMAN: That will come after the Special Mentions.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, please announce whether you are permitting me.

MR. CHAIRMAN: After the Special Mentions.

[**The Deputy Chairman** in the Chair]

SHRI BIR BHADRA PRATAP SINGH (Uttar Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, nearly one lakh dwelling units have been built or are being built by about 200 housing cooperative societies or individuals in various localities in the trans-Jamuna areas of Delhi. The construction was allowed by the Delhi Development Authority and the Delhi Administration under the declared policy of the Government to encourage housing cooperatives to build housing complexes to ease the housing shortage in Delhi.

While thousands of people invested their lives entire savings in the development of sites and construction of dwelling units built or being built under various housing cooperatives formed by them, the Delhi Administration and the DDA miserably failed to put up water pipes and sewage disposal arrangements. With the result that thousands of flats and houses which are already ready are lying vacant. There is also no hope for the provision of water and sewage disposal arrangements being made in the near future because these facilities cannot be provided overnight. I understand that the L. Governor of Delhi has openly told the owners of dwelling units in the trans-